HERITAGE IMPACT ASSESSMENT OF THE IMPACT OF THE PROPOSED DEMOLITION OF GLAMORGAN HOLIDAY HOTEL, PORTHCAWL, CF36 3BW AND A PROPOSED NEW DEVELOPMENT PLANNING APPLICATIONS: P/20/416/CAC (Bridgend) P/20/415/FUL (Bridgend) Version 1



Report by: Trysor

For: Inspire Design Ltd

November 2020



## HERITAGE IMPACT ASSESSMENT OF THE IMPACT OF THE PROPOSED DEMOLITION OF GLAMORGAN HOLIDAY HOTEL, PORTHCAWL, CF36 3BW AND A PROPOSED NEW DEVELOPMENT PLANNING APPLICATIONS: P/20/416/CAC (Bridgend) P/20/415/FUL (Bridgend) Version 1

By

Jenny Hall, MCIfA & Paul Sambrook, MCIfA Trysor

Trysor Project No. 2020/747 HER Event Record PRN – GGAT E006580

For: Inspire Design Ltd

November 2020

38, New Road Gwaun-cae-Gurwen Ammanford Carmarthenshire SA18 1UN <u>www.trysor.net</u> enquiries@trysor.net





Cover photograph: The Glamorgan Holiday Hotel, Porthcawl, looking northwest

### HERITAGE IMPACT ASSESSMENT OF THE IMPACT OF THE PROPOSED DEMOLITION OF GLAMORGAN HOLIDAY HOTEL, PORTHCAWL, CF36 3BW AND A PROPOSED NEW DEVELOPMENT PLANNING APPLICATIONS: P/20/416/CAC (Bridgend) P/20/415/FUL (Bridgend) Version 1

#### RHIF YR ADRODDIAD - REPORT NUMBER: Trysor 2020/747

EVENT RECORD HER PRN – GGAT E006580

**DYDDIAD** 11<sup>fed</sup> Mis Tachwedd 2020 **DATE** 11<sup>th</sup> November 2020

Paratowyd yr adroddiad hwn gan bartneriad Trysor. Mae wedi ei gael yn gywir ac yn derbyn ein sêl bendith.

This report was prepared by the Trysor partners. It has been checked and received our approval.

JENNY HALL MCIFA Jenny Hall

PAUL SAMBROOK MCIFA Paul Sambrook

#### Croesawn unrhyw sylwadau ar gynnwys neu strwythur yr adroddiad hwn.

# We welcome any comments on the content or structure of this report.

*38, New Road, Gwaun-cae-Gurwen Ammanford Carmarthenshire SA18 1UN 01269 826397*  82, Henfaes Road Tonna Neath SA11 3EX 01639 412708

www.trysor.net

enquiries@trysor.net

Trysor is a Registered Organisation with the Chartered Institute for Archaeologists and both partners are Members of the Chartered Institute for Archaeologists, <u>www.archaeologists.net</u>

Jenny Hall (BSc Joint Hons., Geology and Archaeology, MCIfA) had 12 years excavation experience, which included undertaking watching briefs prior to becoming the Sites and Monuments Record Manager for a Welsh Archaeological Trust for 10 years. She has been an independent archaeologist since 2004 undertaking a variety of work that includes upland survey, desk-based appraisals and assessments, and watching briefs.

Paul Sambrook (BA Joint Hons., Archaeology and Welsh, MCIfA, PGCE) has extensive experience as a fieldworker in Wales. He was involved with Cadw's pan-Wales Deserted Rural Settlements Project for 7 years. He has been an independent archaeologist since 2004 undertaking a variety of work including upland survey, desk-based appraisals and assessments, and watching briefs.

## **Event Record PRN – GGAT HER**

PRN	GGAT E006580
Name	Heritage Impact Assessment of the Impact of the
	Proposed Demolition of Glamorgan Holiday Hotel,
	Porthcawl, CF36 3BW and a Proposed New Development
	Planning Applications: P/20/416/CAC (Bridgend)
	P/20/415/FUL (Bridgend)
Туре	VISUAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT
NGR	SS81885376571
Easting	281885
Northing	176571
Summary	In October/November 2020, Trysor carried out a heritage
(English)	impact assessment on the impact to Porthcawl
	Conservation Area from the demolition of the Glamorgan
	Holiday Hotel and a new residential development on
	Porthcawl Conservation Area. © Trysor 2020
Summary	Ym Hydref/Tachwedd 2020, fe gariwyd allan asesiad o
(Cymraeg)	effaith ar dreftadaeth gan Trysor ar gynllun arfaethedig i
	ddymchwel Gwesty Glamorgan ac ail-ddatblygu'r safle ar
	gyfer tai annedd ar Ardal Gadwraeth Porthcawl. $\odot$ Trysor 2020
Description	In October/November 2020, Trysor carried out a heritage
	impact assessment on the impact to Porthcawl
	Conservation Area from the demolition of the Glamorgan
	Holiday Hotel and a new residential development on
	Porthcawl Conservation Area. © Trysor 2020
Sources	Trysor, 2020, Heritage Impact Assessment of the Impact
	of the Proposed Demolition of Glamorgan Holiday Hotel,
	Porthcawl, CF36 3BW and a Proposed New Development
	Planning Applications: P/20/416/CAC (Bridgend)
	P/20/415/FUL (Bridgend)
Copyright	© Trysor 2020

### Contents

	Summary	1
1.	Introduction	2
2.	Methodology	4
3.	Heritage Impact Assessment Stage 1	4
4.	Heritage Impact Assessment Stage 2	5
5.	Heritage Impact Assessment Stage 3	17
6.	Heritage Impact Assessment Stage 4	20
7.	Conservation Area Constraints	23
8.	Conclusion	25
9.	Bibliography	27
	Appendix A: Photographs	29

#### Summary

This report was prepared by Trysor for Inspire Design Ltd during October and November 2020. It assesses the impact of the proposed demolition of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel, Porthcawl on the Porthcawl Conservation Area through the four stages of the Heritage Impact Assessment in Wales process. The report also assesses the impact from a proposed new residential block to take the place of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel, designed by Inspire Design in 2020.

The assessment found that his modern hotel building stands in an area of Porthcawl which developed during the first half of the 19th century around the area known as The Square, in association with the early harbour facility, a generation before the main part of the town was established. The hotel site was cleared of all buildings before the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel was built in 1974. It has been found that the demolition of the building will have no significant impact on the proposed development site. It would however change the historic enclosed character of The Square by opening up its eastern side.

The assessment has found that the proposed replacement for the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel would stand within the current hotel boundaries but is proposed to be a four and five-floor storey building and therefore higher than the present hotel, Recommendations have been made to modify the form, material and colour scheme of the proposed new building to ensure that the proposed apartment block blends in effectively with the character of the Conservation Area and that it would not have a significant, negative impact upon it. The proposed building can both enhance the approach into the Conservation Area from the east and improve the character of The Square, which will potentially become a new thoroughfare into the main shopping area of Porthcawl town following the redevelopment of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel site.

#### 1. Introduction

1.1 This document has been prepared by Trysor at the request of Inspire Design Ltd to assess the impact on Porthcawl Conservation Area from the proposed demolition of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel at SS8186476560 and the implementation of a new development.

1.2 The Conservation Area, centred on SS8172576639, was designated in 1973 and extended in 2015. It includes areas associated with the industrial development in the  $19^{th}$  century and with tourism in the late  $19^{th}$  and  $20^{th}$  century.

1.3 Planning applications for the demolition of the existing building and a creation of a new residential block were submitted to Bridgend County Borough Council in June 2020.

1.3.1 Planning application P/20/416/CAC (Bridgend) was for the Conservation Area consent for the demolition of the existing building.

1.3.2 Planning application P/20/415/FUL (Bridgend) was for planning permission for the demolition of the former Glamorgan Holiday Hotel and erection of a new residential block of 54no. 1, 2 and 3 bedroom apartments and associated works.

1.4 The heritage impact assessment has been prepared to assess the impacts of proposals within the two planning applications on the Porthcawl Conservation Area, see Figure 1.

1.4.1 A site visit was made by Trysor on 8<sup>th</sup> October 2020 to examine the exterior of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel and its setting, as well as the rest of the Porthcawl Conservation Area.

1.5 This report documents the objectives of the proposal, the significance of the monument and the impact of the proposal as submitted with the planning applications in June 2020 (Inspire Design, 2020)

Heritage Impact Assessment of the Impact of the Proposed Demolition Of Glamorgan Holiday Hotel, Porthcawl, CF36 3BW and a Proposed New Development Planning Applications:P/20/416/CAC (Bridgend), P/20/415/FUL(Bridgend)



*Figure 1: Location of the Porthcawl Conservation Area and the proposed Development at Glamorgan Holiday Hotel.* 

#### 2. Methodology

2.1 In response to the request from Inspire Design Ltd for a heritage impact assessment of the impact on Porthcawl Conservation Area from the proposed demolition of Glamorgan Holiday Hotel and redevelopment of the plot the process outlined in "*Heritage Impact Assessment in Wales*" has been followed (Cadw, 2017b). This process applies to Conservation Areas as well as individual historic assets and has four stages;

Stage 1: Explain the objective and why changes are desirable or necessary

Stage 2: Understand the significance of the historic asset

Stage 3: Assess the impact of the proposals.

Stage 4: Set out the reasoning behind the preferred option, including design concepts and principles, in the light of the assessment process

**3. Heritage Impact Assessment Stage 1:** *Explain the objective and why changes are desirable or necessary* 

3.1 The Glamorgan Holiday Home was built for the three Glamorgan councils and opened in 1974. It offered holiday breaks for the elderly and those in poor health.

3.2 When local government was reorganised in 1996 a charitable trust was set up to run the hotel. Over time council contracts fell away and the hotel had to rely on guests booking directly with them. They were competing with changes across the holiday market which was offering more accessible/flexible accommodation and bookings dropped.

3.3 Cartrefi Cymru became involved in 2012 and took over completely on 2015. They closed the hotel while a £1 million refurbishment took place and the hotel reopened in August 2015. However, despite the improvements, bookings were not sufficient and the hotel was still running at a loss. Cartrefi Cymru announced the final closure of the hotel in October 2016.

3.4 The hotel has been left empty since then and been the target of vandals so its condition has deteriorated further.

3.5 The hotel was constructed with a reinforced concrete frame and its design and layout make it difficult to convert.

## 4. Heritage Impact Assessment Stage 2: Understand the

significance of the historic asset

4.1 The Conservation Area at Porthcawl has been defined on the basis of the historic development of the town, with specific areas chosen as they reflect key phases in the growth of the settlement (Ogwr Borough Council Planning Department, 1991 & Heritage & Regeneration Solutions Ltd, 2014).

4.1.1 The seaside town of Porthcawl has relatively late origins, dating to the first half of the 19<sup>th</sup> century and associated with the development of industry within the wider region. The area was undeveloped in the early decades of the century and the 1813 Ordnance Survey Original Surveyors Drawing shows the landscape in its undeveloped state, with only a few scattered farms in the area and mixture of farmland and unenclosed coastal marginal land, see Figure 2. A natural harbour is shown at Porthcawl at this time.



*Figure 2: The 1813 Ordnance Survey Original Surveyors Drawing, scale 2 inches to a mile* 

4.1.2 In 1825, an Act of Parliament was passed to construct a tram road linking coal and ironstone mines in the Maesteg area with the harbour at Porthcawl, where a breakwater was constructed to help shelter ships within the harbour. This development was undertaken by the Duffryn, Llynvi and Porthcawl Railway Company, which was controlled by a number of prominent industrialists and landowners from the coalfield district. Construction was underway by 1826 and newspaper adverts from 1828 show that the new harbour and port was due to be operation in 1829;

"We understand that the dock will be ready for the reception of vessels in May next. A rail-road, sixteen miles in length, communicates with the port, passing through a district abounding with iron and coal of superior quality. Porth Cawl, therefore, will probably, in a very short time, become a place of considerable trade, being so advantageously placed for supplying the coasts of Somerset, Devonshire and Cornwall, with coal." (Exeter Flying Post, 17<sup>th</sup> April 1828)

4.1.3 This early harbour wall, with the harbour entrance on its eastern side, appears to be shown on the 1843 tithe map, see figure 3. The tithe map also shows the nucleus of a settlement beginning to form on the headland adjacent to the western side of the harbour. Several cottages and inns had appeared by this time, concentrated in the area of the proposed development site. The area now known as The Square, to its northwestern side, was also in an early stage of development at this time. This area was home mainly to dockworkers and railway workers during this period.

4.1.4 At this time, the land where the modern town of Porthcawl now stands was mostly owned by Sir Robert Price, proprietor of the Glamorgan Coal and Iron Company, which owned the Tondu Ironworks. He was also a leading shareholder in the *Duffryn, Llynvi and Porthcawl Railway Company*.

4.1.5 By the early 1850s, Sir Robert Price's Glamorgan Coal and Iron Company was weakened by the fall of iron prices. Facing ruin, he sold his business to John Brogden & Sons in 1854. A second phase of development at Porthcawl then followed. Heritage Impact Assessment of the Impact of the Proposed Demolition Of Glamorgan Holiday Hotel, Porthcawl, CF36 3BW and a Proposed New Development Planning Applications:P/20/416/CAC (Bridgend), P/20/415/FUL(Bridgend)



*Figure 3: The 1843 tithe map shows the early development to the west of the harbour. The Glamorgan Holiday Hotel stands on a site which includes parcel 599, the Anchor Inn, a pub which was demolished during the mid-20th century.* 

4.1.6 John Brogden & Sons was founded by John Brogden (1798-1869), a Lancastrian who was to become one of the most prominent industrialists in the Llynfi and Ogmore valleys. Four of his sons were involved in the company, including James, his fourth son, who was to become closely associated with Porthcawl. Brogdens took an interest in the fate of Sir Robert Price's business and during 1853 and 1854 acquired the leases on the Tondu Ironworks and its associated land and mines, paying £35,000 for the ironworks alone.

4.1.7 James Brogden took charge at Tondu and quickly turned the failing ironworks around, expanding operations and dramatically increasing output (Higgins, 1978, 37). The success of their venture in South Wales saw the Brogdens open the standard Ogmore Valley Railway in 1865, which linked to the earlier Llynfi Valley Railway and the latter company's harbour at Porthcawl. The Brogdens and the Llynfi Valley Railway Company united the two railways into the Llynfi and Ogmore Railway in 1866 and also worked in partnership to improve the harbour facilities at Porthcawl, where a new dock and wharf were added, opening in 1867.

4.1.8 It was during this period, in 1865, that James Brogden, on behalf of his family business, purchased thirty two acres of land known as Pickets Lease, adjacent to Porthcawl harbour. Two years later James Brogden had taken the first step towards establishing at town at Porthcawl. He defined a main street, to be named after his father and known as John Street and issued building leases along its western side.

4.1.9 This development did not proceed quickly however. In 1869, John Brogden died and his son Alexander became the senior partner in the family business. A rift had existed for some years between James and Alexander Brogden and the latter had no interest in the development of Porthcawl Town. Between 1871 and 1873, James Brogden was in New Zealand engaged in negotiations with the government there relating to the construction of a new railway system for the country. Little new development seems to have occurred at Porthcawl during this period.

4.1.10 The 1877 Ordnance Survey map shows that there was little development along John Street by that time, see figure 4. The map shows Seabank House, which had been built by James Brogden as a new home for himself (this was later to become the Seabank Hotel).

4.1.11 In 1872 the Brogden brothers formed the *Llynvi, Tondu and Ogmore Coal and Iron Company*. Initial success was followed by disaster as the introduction of the Bessemer steel-making process saw Tondu become outdated and requiring massive new investments. By 1878, the company was in the hands of Receivers. John Brogden & Sons was also plunged into difficulties and in 1880 the company was dissolved, with the partners left with massive debts.

4.1.12 The collapse of the family business did not end the association of James Brogden with Porthcawl. In 1874 he had married his second wife, Caroline Mary Beete, a great-niece of General Sir Thomas Picton of Iscoed, Carmarthenshire. It was Mrs Brogden who was now to play a key role in the development of Porthcawl.

4.1.13 Following the collapse of John Brogden & Sons in 1880, Mrs Brogden bought the 30 acres of land at Pickets Lease which her husband had purchased in 1865. She was the driving force over the next two decades behind the establishment of the new town of Porthcawl. Most of the town, and most of the area covered by the Conservation Area, was built during this period. During this period John Street was developed, the Esplanade laid down with a new road and promenade, and Mary Street and Caroline Street (both named after Mrs Brogden) also appeared. The town acquired a reputation as a seaside resort and Mrs Brogden figured highly in this development. A newspaper report of 1889 states that;

"Mrs Brogden was the owner of twelve houses at Porthcawl and she was anxious to develop Porthcawl as a watering place." (Cardiff Times, 13<sup>th</sup> April, 1889).



*Figure 4: The 1877 Ordnance Survey map shows more detail of the area around The Square. The Ship & Castle Hotel is now The Saltwater Inn, which stands to the north of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel.* 

Heritage Impact Assessment of the Impact of the Proposed Demolition Of Glamorgan Holiday Hotel, Porthcawl, CF36 3BW and a Proposed New Development Planning Applications:P/20/416/CAC (Bridgend), P/20/415/FUL(Bridgend)



Figure 5: The Ordnance Survey's 1884 1:10560 map shows how little of Porthcawl had been built at that time, with most activity focused in the area of the harbour and dock.

4.1.14 The decline in the iron trade was followed by a boom in coal exports through Porthcawl, which helped the town grow and thrive into the early 20<sup>th</sup> century. In 1906, Porthcawl and the Brogdens were hit by the calamitous news of the closure of the harbour by its owners, the Great Western Railway, which now had access to better port facilities at Barry and Port Talbot. James Brogden died at the Esplanade Hotel, Porthcawl in 1907 and his wife died at her home in Victoria Avenue in 1927.

4.1.15 This was not the end of Porthcawl, however, as the popularity of the place as a seaside resort ensured its continuance and success. Its attraction grew in the 20<sup>th</sup> century with the opening of the Coney Beach funfair in 1920 and the addition of the Winter Gardens in 1932. Between 1948 and 2002 the annual Miner's Eisteddfod was held in the town. Porthcawl continues to be a popular location to the present day.

Heritage Impact Assessment of the Impact of the Proposed Demolition Of Glamorgan Holiday Hotel, Porthcawl, CF36 3BW and a Proposed New Development Planning Applications:P/20/416/CAC (Bridgend), P/20/415/FUL(Bridgend)



Figure 6: The Ordnance Survey's 1921 map shows that the town had grown considerably during the around the turn of the 19th and 20th centuries.

4.1.16 Despite its continuing growth northwards and many changes in modern times, the essential character of the Victorian heart of the town is reflected in the architecture of the Esplanade and the streets which lie behind the coastal strip. It is this character which has led to the southern part of the town being designated as a Conservation Area.



Figure 7: The RAF photograph of 1942 shows the development area outlined in red when the earlier buildings were present. The revetment wall is highlighted in yellow. The Anchor Inn is the building at angle across the development area. (Welsh Aerial Photography Unit, 1942)

4.1.17 The proposed development site is defined by the curtilage of the current Glamorgan Holiday Hotel. The land here was undeveloped coastal marginal land until the original harbour was built at Porthcawl in the mid-1820s. This area is shown on the 1813 Ordnance Survey map as being rocky in places. The provision of the harbour and warehouse facilities with a tramroad link to the coalfield sparked the development of a small settlement immediately to the west of the harbour. This comprised of a small number of cottages aligned on a roughly north-south axis facing the harbour as well as the Anchor Inn built on a northeast-southwest alignment.

4.1.18 Above these, on higher ground to the west, early inns such as the Knight's Arms and The Ship and Castle were located alongside another cluster of dwellings. This open area between these two groups of dwellings soon became known as The Square, which has survived as an important open space to the present day. The Square was originally open to the coast on its western side, but by the middle of the 19th century more cottages and a lifeboat station had been built on that side, further enclosing the area.

4.1.19 Along the southeastern side of The Square the land dropped by over 3 metres. This drop may have been a natural low coastal bluff enhanced by quarrying or terracing to accommodate the buildings closest to the harbour. By the later 19th century a substantial stone revetment wall had been built along this edge to define and support the boundaries of the lower-lying cottages and commercial properties to its eastern side. This revetment survives today as one of the few original structures at the development site.

4.1.20 Most of the cottages and buildings to the east of this line had been removed by the mid-20th century and any remaining buildings were cleared in 1974 when the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel was built. The hotel closed off views to the southeast from The Square, creating the enclosed character which is noted in the Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Plan.

#### 4.2 The Conservation Area

4.2.1 Bridgend County Borough Council designated the Porthcawl Conservation Area in August 1973. It covered an area of 12.95 hectares including the harbour and promenade from Porthcawl Point in the east to Irongate Point in the west (Ogwr Borough Council Planning Department, 1991). At that time there were no designated historic assets within the Conservation Area although the Grand Pavilion, Seabank Hotel, Esplanade Hotel, the Pier and Lighthouse were mentioned as buildings of note.

4.2.2 The Conservation Area was defined as being those parts of Porthcawl which were substantially completed prior to 1885 during its period of industrial growth. It drew particular attention to the industrial/maritime elements of the original tidal basin, breakwater and harbour light.

4.2.3 The short description of the character and appearance of the conservation area focused on the more domestic/tourism elements rather than the industrial/maritime.

"The Square and its immediate environs, where the informality of the earlier domestic buildings associated with the port create an intimate scale and character, provides a foil to the nearby terrace of three-storey lodging houses built later in the century on the developing promenade. The short sweep of the promenade from the breakwater to the rising ground of Irongate Point is now the only development of its type in the County, retaining its original character and scale. The newer lower promenade, built in more recent years, is an uncluttered and functional element which in no way detracts from the Victorian character of the sea front." (Ogwr Borough Council Planning Department, 1991)

4.2.4 In 2014 Heritage & Regeneration Solutions Ltd produced a draft Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Plan for the County Borough Council. In October 2020 this is still a draft document, but recommendations in the report to extend the Conservation Area to include the areas below were approved in 2015.

• John Street, the later Victorian commercial heart of the town (originally the commercial sector was based around New Road to the north)

• Esplanade Avenue and part of Picton Avenue for their fine examples of late Victorian/Edwardian terrace housing, with cast iron porch and balcony details

• and the remainder of the seafront open space around Irongate Point, to the west of Seabank Hotel.

4.2.5 Porthcawl also developed further north, in the area of New Road and the Railway Station. This area is not included in the Conservation Area and explains why important community buildings such as places of worship are not found within the Conservation Area.

4.2.6 The landscape setting of the Porthcawl Conservation Area was described in the appraisal as being "*located around a headland with the town centre and Conservation Area facing south over the rocky beach between Porthcawl Point and Irongate Point. The bay between these Points and the sweep of the Esplanade buildings limits the views both east and west along the coast and the view out to sea provides the dominating setting for the Conservation Area with the outline of North Devon clearly visible." (Heritage & Regeneration Solutions Ltd, 2014, 9).* 

4.2.7 The extension of the Conservation Area at Irongate Point, and along the streets inland to the north of the Esplanade, has not changed the essential setting of the area.

4.2.8 In the draft appraisal the Porthcawl Conservation Area was subdivided into seven Character Areas which each reflect different periods of development or areas displaying different architectural styles. These are;

- 1. Esplanade West: the western part of the Esplanade from the Grand Pavilion to the Seabank Hotel.
- 2. Esplanade East: the eastern part of the Esplanade from the Marina Hotel to the Pier Hotel.
- 3. Harbour and Breakwater: the area surrounding the modern harbour and breakwater, including two of the oldest buildings in the Character Area, the Jennings Warehouse and Customs House, as well as the former Promenade Gardens.
- 4. The Square: the area of the late Georgian to early Victorian settlement to the northwest of the first harbour. The development of this Character Area predates the involvement of the Brogden family in the affairs of Porthcawl and the development of the main part of the town. Some of the original buildings remain within the area and the large Glamorgan Holiday Hotel dominates the area to the south of The Square.
- 5. John Street/Well Street: This includes Well Street, the earliest street at the heart of the town, which dates to the 1860s when

James Brogden began selling leases for housing at the start of his plans to develop a new town at Porthcawl. Also included in the main shopping area along John Street which developed post-1865 when Mrs Brogden expanded the development of Porthcawl.

- 6. Hillsborough Place: formerly Railway Terrace, this street was developed in the 1890s for railway workers in the area between John Street and the railway, at the eastern side of the town.
- Esplanade Avenue/Picton Avenue: these parallel streets run north from the Esplanade and date to the end of the 19<sup>th</sup> century. They are notable for their fine terraced villas, most of which still retain attractive cast iron porches and balconies.

4.2.9 The current application falls within the Character Area 4 – The Square. This character area contains elements that are amongst the oldest in the Porthcawl Conservation Area and predate the gentrification of the esplanade area as a tourism attraction. Although known as "The Square" since at least 1899 when it is labelled as such on the 1<sup>st</sup> edition Ordnance Survey map, it does not appear to have been a planned space but rather the meeting of two areas of development.

4.2.10 The draft appraisal described the area as follows:

"In spite of its historic importance as the oldest built-up area of Porthcawl, the view of the Square on arrival through one of the five narrow entrance lanes is a disappointment. Other than the Knight's Arms on the north-west side and three properties to the south, there is a general lack of enclosure with rear elevations, yards and boundary walls of undistinguished buildings including the modern Glamorgan Holiday Home, providing the backdrop.

Current regeneration proposals for Porthcawl have identified the Square as an important location on the pedestrian route from the visitor car parks to the John Street shops and the Esplanade. With the interest of arriving through the narrow lanes this will enable the heritage qualities of this space to be improved through sensitive landscaping with control of parking, and the regeneration of the surrounding sites and buildings to repeat the historic qualities of enclosure.

The Ship & Castle public house is already having major improvements and the potential increase in public awareness

of this hidden area and regeneration focus, should enable the Knight's Arms to have a respectful heritage renovation." Heritage & Regeneration Solutions Ltd, 2014, p.27

4.2.11 There are now 9 Listed Buildings within the Conservation Area although none within The Square character area.

## **5. Heritage Impact Assessment Stage 3:** *Assess the impact of the proposals.*

5.1 The proposed development would take place within Character Area 4 (The Square) of the Porthcawl Conservation Area. This includes The Square and the earliest area of development associated with the original harbour during the first half of the 19<sup>th</sup> century. The development area is not visible from most of the Conservation Area as topography and development block views. It is visible from the harbour area and the southeastern tip of the Esplanade as far as the Pier Hotel. The impacts from the development would therefore affect the southeast of the Conservation Area, in particular draft character areas 3 (Harbour and Breakwater), 4 (The Square) and a small part of area 2 (Esplanade East).

5.1.1 The points below relate to the proposal and design submitted to the Bridgend LPA in June 2020, planning applications P/20/416/CAC and P/20/415/FUL. This will be revised as the scheme develops.

5.2 There would be series of impacts caused by the demolition of the existing Glamorgan Holiday Hotel to the Character Area 4 (The Square).

- Loss of a large building which dates to 1974 after the creation of the Conservation Area (Plates 1 to 7, 18 to 26).
- Potential loss of historic stone boundary walls defining the development site to its west and south (Plates 22 to 25)
- Opening up the eastern side of The Square, Character Area 4, the historic enclosed character of which is noted in the Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Plan (Heritage & Regeneration Solutions Ltd, 2014, p. 27).
- Change of the view into the Conservation Area from the east. The rear of the buildings along the Esplanade would become more visible, which is neither an attractive or informative view (Plates 27, 31).

5.3 There would be a series of potential impacts on this part of the Conservation Area caused by the construction of a new building on the present site of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel. At present, it is envisaged that a five-floor residential building with on-site parking on the ground floor would replace the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel.

• Potential direct impact on buried archaeology – including evidence of early 19<sup>th</sup> century buildings and/or earlier archaeological deposits.

• Potential loss of historic boundary walls defining the development site.

• The construction of a building of inappropriate mass or design, causing a negative impact on the character of the Conservation Area and views of the Conservation Area.

• A building of appropriate design and mass at this location could enhance the view of the Conservation Area from the east, which would be a positive impact.

5.4 The proposal would cause indirect impacts on the setting of the adjacent Character Area 2 (Esplanade East).

• The view from east would be slightly reduced by higher and longer building. The backs of the buildings on the Eastern part of the Esplanade would be hidden – Very Low impact

• The view northeast from the end of the Pier Hotel would now include a larger building, cutting views of the Salt Lake car park and across to Coney Beach. That is not a key view in terms of those defined by the Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Plan (Draft) and is likely to alter under LPA plans for regeneration of that area. This would be a Very Low impact on the Conservation Area.

5.4.1 The development would not otherwise be visible from the Esplanade East character area (Plates 10 and 11) and would not affect views to the west and southwest from The Square when looking at the rear of the buildings along the Esplanade.

5.5 The proposal would cause indirect impacts on the setting of the adjacent Character Area 3 (Harbour and Breakwater).

5.5.1 There are no key views of, or from, the Harbour area which are defined by the Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Plan (Draft) which would be affected by the proposed development.

5.5.2 The proposed new building would partially reduce views of some buildings to the rear of the Esplanade and to the southern side of The Square, when viewed from the area to the west and south of the Marina (Plates 3 and 4). This is only a partial view at present and therefore the loss of view would only cause a Very Low visual impact. The current view of these buildings is not especially attractive or informative.

5.5.3 There is also a view of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel from the southeastern end of the Promenade, looking northwest and across the

former Promenade Gardens area. The new building would similarly close off part of the view of the buildings to the rear of the Esplanade but this too is not an attractive or informative view at present and the impact would be Very Low. There are currently proposals to build a new visitor facility at the Promenade Gardens, which would close this view off from the Promenade entirely (Plate 5)

5.4 The remainder of the Conservation Area (including the other 4 Character Areas (1, 5, 6 and 7) would not be impacted upon by the proposed development (Plates 8 to 16).

**6. Heritage Impact Assessment Stage 4:** Set out the reasoning behind the preferred option, including design concepts and principles, in the light of the assessment process

6.1 The Glamorgan Holiday Home was built for the three Glamorgan councils and opened in 1974. It offered holiday breaks for the elderly and those in poor health. The hotel was a purpose-built facility, with 39 bedrooms (28 single and 11 twin) most of them with en-suite or washing facilities. There was a lounge, kitchen and entertainment areas. Some of the staff lived in two self-contained flats. The building itself was built on a reinforced concrete frame with a variety of heights and roofs.

6.1.1 When local government was reorganised in 1996 a charitable trust was set up to run the hotel. Over time council contracts fell away and the hotel had to rely on guests booking directly with them. They were competing with changes within the holiday market which was offering more accessible/flexible accommodation and bookings dropped.

6.1.2 Cartrefi Cymru took over the hotel during 2012. They closed the hotel while a £1 million refurbishment took place and the hotel reopened in August 2015. However, despite the improvements, bookings were not sufficient and the hotel was still running at a loss. Cartrefi Cymru announced the final closure of the hotel in October 2016.

6.1.3 It has been deduced from this experience that the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel is not a commercially viable operation and the building itself is not suitable for conversion for alternative use, due to its layout and its method of construction. Therefore, the present owners seek to demolish the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel and replace it with a new residential apartment complex.

6.2 Inspire Design, on behalf of Xcape Limited, have prepared a Design and Access Statement (DAS) to support an application for full planning permission for an apartment complex on the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel site (Inspire Design, 2020). The site is irregular in shape and occupies an area of approximately 0.37 hectares. Under the Local Planning Authority's Policy COM3 Householder Development, the development site is classified as a windfall site and is therefore suitable for residential development.

6.2.1 The proposed development would consist of 54 residential dwellings with associated facilities. 38 of the dwellings would be apartments for the open market (a mix of 1, 2 and 3 bedrooms). The remaining 16 dwellings (30%) would be affordable properties (a mix of 1 and 2 bedrooms), in accord with the Local Planning Authority's Policy

COM5 Affordable Housing. The development would include a new vehicular and pedestrian access point off The Portway serving a ground floor car park and the affordable housing. A new pedestrian access point dedicated for the open market apartments would be located off The Square. There would be landscape amenity spaces around the complex (Policy COM11 Provision of Outdoor Recreation Facilities).

6.2.2 The proposed apartment complex has been designed in accord with local planning policy and guidance in terms of the percentage of affordable housing included, the provision of green space for amenity purposes and provision of car parking (full details are provided in the Design and Access Statement).

6.3 The design of the apartment complex has also been prepared to take into account a series of constraints relating to the site, in terms of vehicular access, proximity to a busy road and tourist attractions, the drop in ground level from west to east and the location of the site within the Porthcawl Conservation Area. A full list of constraints is provided in the Design and Access Statement (Inspire, 2019, 28).

6.4 The design is also influenced by a series of opportunities, including the redevelopment of a brownfield site, the provision of much needed housing in a modern building and the improvement of the landscape amenity, enhancing a key site on the approach to the Esplanade from the east. A full list of opportunities is provided in the Design and Access Statement (Inspire, 2019, 29).

6.5 The layout of the proposed apartment complex is a response to the constraints of the modest and irregular site within which it would stand and the need to support a double frontage onto the Portway on the eastern side of the site and onto The Square on the northwestern side which is over 3 metres higher in terms of ground level.

6.5.1 The S-shaped plan of the building allows it to be set back as much as possible from the existing boundaries of the site, maximising the amenity space surrounding the building.

6.5.2 The design separates the open market apartments (five floors) and affordable housing apartment (four floors) into different blocks, with separate pedestrian access, but shared vehicular access at lower ground floor level.

6.5.3 The design endeavours to keep the mass of the proposed building to an appropriate scale. Hence the five-floor wing of the complex is set back from the Portway and parapet heights have been reduced to reduce the overall height of the building. The northern part of the complex has been designed as a four-floor block to lessen the impact on adjacent buildings.

6.6 The design and appearance of the building, as shown in the 2020 Design and Access Statement, has been influenced by the curves of the coastline, the maritime heritage of Porthcawl and the materials used in many of the historic buildings within the town.

#### **7.** Conservation Area Constraints

7.1 The fact that the proposed development is located within the Porthcawl Conservation Area introduces a number of constraints in terms of potential impacts on the historic environment.

7.2 Section 6 of the Porthcawl Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Plan (Draft, 2014) provides Policy Guidance and Design Principles relating to development proposals within the Conservation Area.

7.2.1 Section 6.3. "Policies for new development within heritage areas" (p.52) includes a list of guiding principles which should be applied;

- *a) Preserve and reinforce the distinctive pattern of traditional development, including street patterns, open spaces and trees, plot boundaries & boundary treatments.* 
  - The proposed development would take place within the boundaries of the present Glamorgan Holiday Hotel and would maintain those boundaries. The area of landscaped amenity space would be increased.
- *b)* Have regard for existing building lines & the orientation of existing development.
  - Generally the new building would conform to the orientation of the development site, and would reflect the adjacent Portway road. The step down of 3 metres or so from The Square to ground level within the development site would mean that the lower ground floor of the new building would be set down in the landscape to the west and north. Therefore although it is a storey higher than the present Glamorgan Holiday Hotel, the roof of the new building would not significantly break the skyline. It would break the skyline slightly more when viewed from outside the conservation area to the east, but would not be visible from most of the rest of the Conservation Area to the west, northwest and north.
- c) Reinforce the distinctive architectural character of the particular Character Area of the Conservation Area, through an informed understanding of its building forms and styles, features and materials. Pastiche forms of development and the superficial echoing of historic features in new buildings should be avoided.

- There isn't a distinctive character to this rather diverse character area where older buildings have been modernised and extended and it will replace a modern building. The design and appearance should to reflect the colours and textures of the Character Area, which are dominated by whites and creams as well as some bare stonework. Many of the buildings within the wider Conservation Area are rendered and painted in cream and white. This is particularly true of the adjacent Character Area 2, Esplanade East.
- d) Respect the scale and massing of surrounding buildings. It is essential that new development is not out of scale with existing buildings by way of its height, floor levels, size of windows and doors, overall massing and roofscape.
  - As that the development area is set down relative to the land to the west and north due to the drop in ground level to the east of The Square, a new building rising to four and five storey height will not appear incongruous with the other buildings within the Conservation Area, which include substantial four storey buildings along the Esplanade, the six to seven storey Esplanade House and the substantial Breaksea Care Home. These large buildings are all visible in the most important views of the development site from the east and northeast. Setting the building back from the development site boundaries would avoid the building appearing dominant or overbearing. Vertical faces overshadowing The Square should be stepped back to reduce the impact The Square. This will open up The Square whilst still maintaining the enclosed feel.
- *e) Maintain key views and vistas within, into and out of the Conservation Area.* 
  - The proposed development would not impact on any of the key views within, into or out of the Conservation Area as identified in the Porthcawl Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Plan (Draft, 2014).
- *f)* Where possible, minimise the visual impact of parked vehicles and the provision of parking areas on the streetscape and landscape setting of historic buildings.
  - Parking will be beneath the apartment complex on the Lower Ground Floor, as with the present arrangement, preserving the streetscape and setting of historic buildings in the surrounding area.

#### 8. Conclusion

8.1 This assessment has found that the demolition of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel would not have a significant negative impact on the Porthcawl Conservation Area. The building is of modern date and style and as a modern intrusion doesn't conform to the character of the Conservation Area.

8.1.1 The Glamorgan Holiday Hotel stands within the Conservation Area Character Area 4, The Square, which was the earliest part of Porthcawl to develop. A row of cottages and the Anchor Inn stood on the site in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century, but most of these had been removed by the mid-20<sup>th</sup> century. When the site was prepared for the construction of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel in 1974, all remaining vestiges of the original buildings in this area were cleared away.

8.1.2 The only significant surviving features which predate the construction of the hotel are the high retaining wall which forms the western boundary wall of the hotel grounds today and part of a high stone wall which forms the southern boundary of the hotel property.

8.1.3 The retention of these stone boundary walls should be ensured during the demolition of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel as they are the only identifiable historic features at the proposed development site.

8.1.4 The removal of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel would however open up The Square, which is described as an enclosed area in the Porthcawl Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Plan, changing its character.

8.1.5 It would also change the view into the Conservation Area from the east, exposing the rear of the buildings along the Esplanade, which is not an attractive or informative view.

8.2 The assessment has also found that the construction of the proposed apartment complex on the site of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel would not have a significant negative impact on the Conservation Area.

8.2.1 With the use of appropriate design and materials, the new building could enhance a key site on the approach to the Esplanade and the Conservation Area from the east.

8.2.2 The design proposed in the Design and Access Statement (Inspire, 2020) includes several important principles. The proposed apartment complex would be set back as much as possible from the existing boundaries of the site, maximising the amenity space surrounding the

building; pedestrian access would be provided from to the Portway to the east and The Square to the northwest; vehicular access into the site would be improved from the Portway to a lower ground floor car park beneath the apartments. The building itself would be designed with parapet heights reduced and the five-floor block set back from the Portway to reduce the mass of the building in views from the road to the east, whilst a four-floor northern block is intended to lessen its impact on buildings to the north.

8.2.3 The design presented in the Design and Access Statement in June 2020 is however relatively vertical in form and appearance and would appear particularly dominant from the north and northwest, from the area of The Square and The Saltwater Inn.

8.2.4 The choice of building materials, chosen to reflect the materials used within the Conservation Area, includes red brick as a prominent element in the design. Red brick is in fact not common in Character Area 4 or the adjacent Character Areas 2 and 3 and it does therefore appear incongruous in this part of the Conservation Area. Replacing it with stone or a more sympathetic texture should be considered.

8.2.5 To avoid the building appearing overbearing, it is thought that the adoption of a less vertical style, particularly on the north and northwest sides of the building would be a positive development. The Square is particularly important as it is highlighted in the Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Plan (p.27) as a potential pedestrian route from visitor car parks to the east to the main shopping area of John Street and the Esplanade, which could be enhanced with the sensitive landscaping and regeneration of surrounding sites and buildings, which would include the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel site.

8.2.6 To enable the proposed apartment complex to match the character of the Conservation area, it is suggested that the colour scheme of the new building blends creams and white, with a combination of cement rendered and stone-faced elevations (preferably matching the light coloured limestones of the district which are used in the boundary walls of the site).

#### 9. Bibliography

Heritage & Regeneration Solutions Ltd, 2014, Porthcawl Conservation Area Appraisal & Management Plan

Cadw, 2011, Conservation Principles.

Cadw, 2017a, Managing Setting of Historic Assets in Wales.

Cadw, 2017b, Managing Heritage Impact Assessment in Wales

Higgins, L.S., 1978, "The Brogden Pioneers of the Early Industrial Development in Mid-Glamorgan" in the *National Library of Wales Journal*, Vol.20, No.3

Inspire Design, 2020, *Design and Access Statement, Proposed Apartment complex, Former Glamorgan Holiday Hotel, The Square, Porthcawl, South Glamorgan, Wales, CF36 3BW* Dated 12<sup>th</sup> June 2020

Newton Nottage parish tithe map, 1843

Newton Nottage parish tithe apportionment, 1846

Ogwr Borough Council Planning Department, 1991, *Conservation Areas in the Borough of Ogwr*, 3<sup>rd</sup> edition

Ordnance Survey, 1813, 2 inch to 1 mile scale Original Surveyors Drawings, Bridgend Sheet

Ordnance Survey, 1830, 1 inch to 1 mile First Series Map

Ordnance Survey, 1877, 1:2500 scale First Edition map Glamorgan XXXIX.16 (Newton Nottage)

Ordnance Survey, 1899, 1:2500 scale Second Edition map Glamorgan XXXIX.16 (Newton Nottage)

Ordnance Survey, 1918, 1:2500 scale Third Edition map Glamorgan XXXIX.16 (Newton Nottage)

Ordnance Survey, 1943, 1:2500 scale map Glamorgan XXXIX.16 (Newton Nottage)

Ordnance Survey, 1966, 1:2500 scale map Glamorgan XXXIX.16 (Newton Nottage)

#### 9.1 Photographic sources

Welsh Aerial Photography Unit, 1942, 4215 RAF M3051 96 Welsh Aerial Photography Unit, 1950, 5019 RAF58\_497 5019 Welsh Aerial Photography Unit, 1957, 5713 RAF58\_2328 F21 0032 Welsh Aerial Photography Unit, 1967, July 3rd 6745 OS 67\_283 332 Welsh Aerial Photography Unit, 1974, 7454 OS74\_236 014 Welsh Aerial Photography Unit, 1978, OS78\_087 368 Welsh Aerial Photography Unit, 1982, 8236 ADAS91 194 Welsh Aerial Photography Unit, 1991, Geonex7491 185 Heritage Impact Assessment of the Impact of the Proposed Demolition Of Glamorgan Holiday Hotel, Porthcawl, CF36 3BW and a Proposed New Development Planning Applications:P/20/416/CAC (Bridgend), P/20/415/FUL(Bridgend)

Appendix C: Photographs Heritage Impact Assessment of the Impact of the Proposed Demolition Of Glamorgan Holiday Hotel, Porthcawl, CF36 3BW and a Proposed New Development Planning Applications:P/20/416/CAC (Bridgend), P/20/415/FUL(Bridgend)



Figure 8: Location of photographs looking into draft Character Area 4: The Square


*Figure 9: Location of photographs within in the draft Character Area 4: The Square* 



*Figure 10: Location of photographs looking along the Esplanade towards the draft Character Area 4: The Square* 



*Plate 1: Looking west-southwest across the filled in dock area, now in use as a car park/open space but may be developed in the future under regeneration plans. The Glamorgan Holiday Hotel is on the left.* 



*Plate 2: Looking southwest from the Eastern Promenade with the Jennings warehouse on the left and the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel on the right.* 



*Plate 3: Looking northwest from the road down to the harbour towards the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel on the right. The Pier Hotel is to the right.* 



*Plate 4: Looking northwest from the south side of the Outer Basin of the former Dock towards the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel. It can be seen to stand on lower ground than the Pier Hotel to the left.* 



Plate 5: Looking north towards the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel in the background on the right. The hoarding is around the former "Cosy Corner" park area which is due to be developed. The proposed structure would block this view of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel.



*Plate 6: Looking north-northeast from the eastern end of the Esplanade at Glamorgan Holiday Hotel. It can be seen to sit on lower ground than the Pier Hotel on the left of the photograph and consequently is not visible from most of the Conservation Area.* 



*Plate 7: Looking north at the Pier Hotel on the left and the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel to the right* 



*Plate 8: Looking north-northwest along the eastern end of the Esplanade. The Glamorgan Hotel is not in this view lying to the right of the Pier Hotel.* 



*Plate 9: Looking west-northwest along the Esplanade. The Glamorgan Hotel is not in this view.* 



*Plate 10: Looking east-northeast, The Square is at the far end of the lane on the left. The Glamorgan Holiday Hotel is shielded from view by the buildings along the Esplanade.* 



*Plate 11: Looking east-southeast towards the Marine Hotel and the buildings that partially back onto The Square. The Glamorgan Holiday Hotel is shielded from view by the buildings along the Esplanade.* 



*Plate 12: Looking east along the Esplanade. The Glamorgan Hotel is not in visible in this view.* 



*Plate 13: Looking east-southeast from the western part of the Esplanade. The Glamorgan Holiday Hotel is not visible in this view and the proposed 5 storey development would also not be seen.* 



*Plate 14: Looking east southeast from The Green. The Glamorgan Holiday Hotel is not visible in this view and the proposed 5 storey development would also not be seen.* 



Plate 15: Looking east along Well Street towards Dock Street.



*Plate 16: Looking southeast at the junction of Dock Street and John Street.* 



*Plate 17: Looking west from Hillsboro Place car park to Dock Street and the Breaksea Care Home. Dock Street forms the northern edge of the Conservation Area here.* 



*Plate 18: Looking south-southwest from the Hillsboro Place car park, the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel on the left, the Saltwater Inn (formerly the Ship and Castle) in the centre and Breaksea Care Home on the right.* 



*Plate 19: Looking east from The Square across the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel* 



*Plate 20: Looking south at the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel with the Saltwater Inn (formerly the Ship and Castle) to the right.* 



Plate 21: Looking northwest towards the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel.



Plate 22: Looking north-northeast at the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel. The southern stone wall boundary is visible to the right of the photograph and the western revetment wall is hidden by vegetation



Plate 23: Looking northeast to the western side of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel over the stone retaining wall. This wall has been patched and repaired but appears to be one of the few remaining features of the early development to the west of the harbour.



Plate 24: Looking south along the western boundary of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel. This retaining wall is supported by more recent buttresses but the first ones were put in place when a building against the wall was removed prior to the construction of the hotel (Welsh Aerial Photography Unit 1967 and 1974)



Plate 25: Looking south along the western boundary of the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel showing the stone retaining wall. The upper part of this wall may have been rebuilt but probably continues below ground to a similar level as the rest of the retaining wall which defined around this area previously



*Plate 26: Looking east-southeast across The Square towards the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel.* 



*Plate 27: Looking west-northwest across The Square towards the partially demolished Knights Arms and the rear of 4 storey buildings along the Esplanade* 



Plate 28: Looking north-northeast across The Square



Plate 29: Looking north across The Square



*Plate 30: Looking north-northwest across The Square and down Marine Terrace.* 



*Plate 31: Looking northeast across "The Square" from outside the Glamorgan Holiday Hotel towards the partially demolished Knights Arms and the rear of 4 storey buildings along the Esplanade* 



Plate 32: Looking southwest out of The Square towards The Esplanade



*Plate 33: Looking south-southeast across The Square towards the houses to the rear of 34 to 37 The Esplanade. This group may contain earlier elements in the development of this area.*